DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 278 827 CE 046 367

AUTHOR Douglass, Rebecca S.; Maxfield, Randi A.
TITLE BVT Curriculum Package Assessment Project. Final Report.
INSTITUTION Sangamon State Univ., Springfield, Ill. East Central Curriculum Management Center.
SPONS AGENCY Office of Vocational and Adult Education (ED), Washington, DC.
PUB DATE Jan 87
NOTE 21p.
PUB TYPE Reports - Evaluative/Feasibility (142)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Bilingual Education Programs; *Bilingual Instructional Materials; *Curriculum Development; Educational Needs; Federal Programs; Postsecondary Education; *Program Effectiveness; Program Evaluation; *Program Improvement; Secondary Education; *Vocational Education

ABSTRACT

A panel of bilingual specialists met in Alexandria, Virginia, in November 1986 to review curriculum packages developed by projects supported by the U.S. Department of Education's (USDE) Bilingual Vocational Training (BVT) grants. The USDE was interested in assessing the quality of curriculum development in current BVT projects, determining the transportability of project curriculum materials, and providing direction and assistance to improve future projects. The panel used an assessment instrument devised by USDE staff. Some of the committee's findings were the following: (1) BVT project staff need directions regarding format, elements, and sequencing in order to provide consistency; (2) definitions need to be clarified; (3) projects need technical assistance even after standards are set; (4) projects are different in their approaches to BVT curriculum development; (5) vocational training sections of curriculum packages are more fully developed than the ESL-related sections; (6) discrepancies existed on how to determine the language proficiency of students and the projects' methods of accommodating various language levels; and (7) curriculum packages often were not well thought out. The experts rated highest those packages that were well organized, contained the usual elements of curriculum guides, showed evidence of staff coordination, showed evidence of individualized instruction, and had a strong rationale for methodology. As a result of the assessment, recommendations were made for more technical assistance in BVT curriculum development, additional assessment, and dissemination of exemplary projects. (A list of the projects reviewed, meeting agenda, and assessment instrument are included in this report.) (KC)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED278621

F I N A L R E P O R T

"BVT Curriculum Package Assessment Project"

Curriculum Materials Development

P.O. No. 103407

January, 1987

Conducted for the U.S. Department of Education,
Department of Adult, Vocational and Technical Education,
Bilingual Vocational Training

by

Rebecca S. Douglass, Project Director
Randi A. Maxfield, Research Assistant

Sangamon State University
Springfield, IL 62794-9243

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

✓ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

CE046361

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Project Abstract
(Page i)

Page

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. THE COMMITTEE 1-2

III. ASSESSMENT OVERVIEW

Findings and Recommendations 2-3
Findings Keyed to the Assessment Instrument 3-4

IV. RECOMMENDATIONS

Technical Assistance 4
Assessment 4
Dissemination 4-5
Standards 5

V. SUMMARY 5-6

VI. ATTACHMENTS

Attachment A - List of Projects 7
Attachment B - Agenda 8
Attachment C - Instrument (NOT INCLUDED)
Attachment D - Revised Instrument
Attachment E - Definitions

PROJECT ABSTRACT

TITLE: Curriculum Materials Development

PURCHASE ORDER NUMBER: 103407

COMPLETION DATE: January 1, 1987

FUNDING AGENCY: U. S. Department of Education
Office of Vocational and Adult Education

PROJECT OFFICER: Nancy E. Smith
(202) 732-2269

PROJECT DIRECTOR: Rebecca Douglass, Director
East Central Curriculum Coordination Center
Sagamon State University F-2
Springfield, IL 62708
(217) 786-6375

The project director will convene a panel of experts to review and critique the curriculum materials submitted by eighteen federally-funded Bilingual Vocational Training (BVT) projects. The project director will be responsible for:

a) Planning the panel meeting. The four day meeting will be held in Washington, DC in November 1986.

b) Arranging for six experts to serve as panelists. The project director will pay for travel, per diem, and honoraria. The panelists will be selected in consultation with OVAE staff members.

c) Recommending a standard curriculum format for BVT projects.

d) Preparing a report on the panel meeting.

INTRODUCTION

On November 17-19, 1986, a panel of bilingual specialists was convened at The American Vocational Association offices in Alexandria, VA.

The purpose of the panel meeting was to review curriculum packages developed by projects (See Attachment A) supported by the U.S. Department of Education (USDE) BVT grants.

The USDE was interested in:

1. **Assessing the quality of curriculum development in current BVT projects.**
2. **Determining the transportability of project curriculum materials.**
3. **Providing direction and assistance to improve future projects.**

The agenda (See Attachment B) included the review of an assessment instrument developed by project staff; application of the instrument to the curriculum packages by the panel; compilation of results by the project staff; and development of recommendations for USDE.

THE COMMITTEE

The committee represented bilingual expertise from across the country.

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

Bill Bliss
Language and Communication Consultant

Ron Castaldi, USDE
Program Coordinator
Bilingual Vocational Education

Rebecca S. Douglass, Director
East Central Network
Sangamon State University

Mary M. Galvan
Education Consultant

Jean Lopez-Valadez
Northwest Educational Cooperative

Linda Mrowicki
Northwest Educational Cooperative

Jenise Rowekamp
Consultant

Nancy Smith, USDE
Bilingual Vocational Education

ASSESSMENT OVERVIEW

The committee revised the instrument and was briefed on the background of the BVT projects by the USDE/BVT staff in order to gain an understanding of the current project activities and possible future directions.

The panelists independently rated the curriculum packages using the revised instrument (See attachment D). A general discussion of the panelists' impressions and a preliminary set of recommendations was developed.

The Project Director compiled the assessment data and presented the ranked list to the committee with a composite of general strengths and weaknesses. The committee then finalized its set of findings and recommendations and reported these in a de-briefing session with USDE/BVT staff Nancy Smith, Ron Castaldi, Laura Karl, and Kate Holmberg.

Findings and Recommendations

The committee's discussion, based on their experiences and knowledge of BVT along with the results of the assessment, led to several **Observational Findings:**

1. BVT Project staff need directions regarding format, elements and sequencing in order to provide consistency.
2. Definitions need to be provided both for the staff new to curriculum development and for those who have experience but conflicting definitions.
3. Projects need technical assistance even after standards are set. Need for staff development of BVT instructors is continuous due to staff turn-over and general need for reinforcecement. BVT resources already developed need wider and better dissemination. (eg. SEA and LEB guides; "How to Develop BVT Curriculum": "Success Factors in BVT" bulletins).
4. Projects are in different stages of development. Some have better foundations than others due to staff background, length of existence, etc.

5. Projects are different in their approaches to BVT curriculum development (ie grammatical approach vs. competency-based).
6. Vocational training sections of curriculum packages are more fully developed than the ESL-related sections (probably due to the vocational program existing first and the ESL component added on in some projects).
7. Some projects appear to have been native language projects originally with the BVT component added on.
8. Curriculum packages rated as poor don't necessarily mean the package is bad. It is more likely a function of lack of time to develop the curriculum package or lack of expertise of staff.
9. Most programs didn't realize that their curriculum would be evaluated. They will likely do better next time.
10. Grants vs. performance-based BVT Project Contracts make it more difficult for USDE to get high-quality consistency among project curriculum packages.
11. Discrepancies on how to determine the language proficiency of students and the projects' methods of accommodating various language levels calls into question whether projects are actually conducting bilingual programs and/or at what level ESL is operating. Little or no evidence or documentation exists in some cases. Few projects had a rationale for when and how to address language requirements.
12. There is a general hesitancy among BVT programs to share materials. This hesitancy needs to be overcome.
13. Projects' curriculum packages generally indicated that they were not well-thought out. This may have been due to the short time for development and lack of curriculum standards at the beginning of the project.
14. Life span of the program or agency conducting the program influences overall quality.

Findings Keyed to the Assessment Instrument

The highest rated curriculum packages:

____were well-organized, well-stated, and concise descriptions of the program components with examples
____addressed most of the areas of the instrument including Introduction; Curriculum Development Process; Course Description; Content; Instructional Methods and Techniques; Evaluation; References and Resources; and Format.
____showed evidence of staff coordination.
____showed evidence of an integrated approach.
____showed evidence of individualized instruction.
____had a strong rationale for methodology.

The most commonly rated weaknesses included (in order of frequency):

____lack of sample lessons
____lack of table of contents

____lack of performance objectives
____lack of student certification of competencies
____lack of a description of pre-requisite skills (including language)
____poorly-stated philosophy
____inadequate safety considerations
____weak description of recruitment

RECOMMENDATIONS

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

There is an obvious need for technical assistance in BVT curriculum development:

1. USDE should endeavor to make documents already developed more widely available to assist and guide project staff.
2. Every beginning project should be given a "Beginner's Packet" of resources.
3. On-site technical assistance is desirable for instructors as well as technical assistance meetings of all project administrators.
4. USDE should develop resources not in existence which will assist projects (eg. reading and writing tests).

ASSESSMENT

USDE should employ a two-phase assessment. **Phase one** would be similar to the panel's activity in evaluating the curriculum package and identifying the most promising curriculum. **Phase two** would involve more intense work with the projects rated "high" to develop quality curriculum and instructional materials for wide dissemination. These projects should be provided with additional resources to allow time for curriculum development due to the wide use of part-time instructors. These may be used as models.

DISSEMINATION

There is an obvious need for better dissemination of high-quality BVT curriculum resources. There is also a hesitancy to share curriculum. It is believed that better quality will encourage increased sharing.

1. Projects should be required to submit a curriculum package to USDE for initial evaluation of the quality and progress of the project. From an assessment of these, USDE can determine the projects with the most promise of developing resources for wide dissemination.
2. USDE should develop a plan for dissemination of BVT curriculum which may include a national dissemination conference to involve others in bilingual education (may be a feature of an existing bilingual education conference or a vocational conference such as the National Network for Curriculum Coordination and Vocational Technical Education--National Concurrent Meeting held in July each year).
3. BVT projects should be made aware of vocational resources available through the Bilingual Centers and NNCCVTE. Projects should be encouraged to work with their regional centers for technical assistance and dissemination of BVT curriculum.
4. USDE should provide samples of expected outcomes.

STANDARDS

1. Definitions should be provided to assure consistency of understanding among vocational and bilingual curriculum developers.
2. The revised curriculum assessment instrument (curriculum checklist) should be used as minimum acceptable standards.
3. Future use of the instrument may include weighting of items and tallying of total scores for comparison purposes.
4. RFP's should be strengthened to include USDE requirements for curriculum package development and dissemination.

SUMMARY

Evaluators were exemplary in their dedication to the task and insightful comments which are summarized herein.

Composite results of the assessments were sent to BVT project directors for assistance in improving the final products to be completed in 1987. A revised instrument was developed by the BVT Curriculum Assessment Program Staff and submitted to USDE.

All projects are to be commended for their efforts in developing first drafts of curriculum packages in the absence of a stable set of criteria and in a short time frame.

The U.S. Department of Education BVT staff is to be commended for their efforts to document the progress of BVT projects, to improve the quality of BVT curriculum, and to disseminate the outcomes of high-quality programs in order to encourage replication.

LIST OF PROJECTS

1. Data Entry, Quick Service Mechanics, Home Health Aide, and Arc Welding; Arizona Department of Education

2. Clerical and Word Processing; General Labor; Asians for Job Opportunities in Berkeley, Inc. -- Adelante, Inc.

3. Chinese Cooking and Bartending/Waiting; Charity Cultural Services Center

4. Banking/Finance and General Clerical; Chinatown Resources Development Center

5. General Machinist, Electronics Training, and Property Management/Building Maintenance; Elk Grove Unified School District

6. Culinary Arts and Home Health Aide/Nursing Assistant; Peralta Community College and Edith M. Austin Skills Center

7. Light Manufacturing and Clerical; Metropolitan State College

8. Clerical, Security Guard, Nurse's Aide, Food Service, Emergency Medical Technician; New Opportunities for Waterbury, Inc. -- NOW

9. Air Conditioning and Heating Services; Oakton Community College

10. Restaurant Cook and Nursing Assistant; St. Augustine College

11. Carpentry and Culinary Arts; Crownpoint Institute of Technology

12. Chinese Cooking; China Institute in America

13. Clerical, Data-Entry, and Automated Bookkeeping; Chinatown Manpower Project, Inc.

14. Bilingual Microcomputer Business Skills Course; HACER, Inc.

15. Drafting; New York Association for New Americans, Inc.

16. Bilingual Learning and Employment Training (Billet); Community College of Rhode Island

17. Industrial Electricity; Houston Community College System

18. Building Trades, Clerical, Food Service, and Printing Trades; Arlington County Public Schools

19. Bilingual Computer Operating Personnel; Utah Technical College at Salt Lake - Salt Lake Skills Center

BILINGUAL VOCATIONAL TRAINING
Curriculum Evaluation

November 17 - 19, 1986
American Vocational Association Headquarters
Alexandria, Virginia

Objectives: **To train evaluators in the use of the assessment instrument.**

To evaluate eighteen curriculum packages using the assessment instrument.

* * * * * * *

Monday, November 17, 1986

8:30 a.m.	Welcome and Introductions	AVA Official
	Contract Review	Rebecca Douglass East Central Network
	Overview of Bilingual Vocational Training Project	Ron Castaldi and Nancy Smith Bilingual Vocational Education, U.S.D.E.
	Review of Agenda	
9:00 a.m.	Review of Assessment Instrument Questions	Rebecca Douglass East Central Network
10:00 a.m.	Review of Curriculum Packages	
12:00 - 1:00 p.m.	Lunch	
1:00 - 4:30 p.m.	Continued Review of Curriculum Packages	

Tuesday, November 18, 1986

8:30 a.m.	Questions and Answers Continue Review of Curriculum Packages
12:00 - 1:00 p.m.	Lunch
1:00 - 4:30 p.m.	Continue Review of Curriculum Packages

Wednesday, November 19, 1986

8:30 a.m.	Review of Evaluator Results Recommendations to the U.S. Department of Education Travel Reimbursement Forms
12:00 noon	Adjourn

ATTACHMENT D

BILINGUAL VOCATIONAL TRAINING
CURRICULUM CHECKLIST

Title: _____

Developer: _____

Date of Draft: _____

Instructions: Each curriculum package will be rated using the following scale:

NA = Standard does not apply to this material
O = Elements of the standard are not present/No
1 = Not adequate to standard
2 = Adequately meets standard/Yes
3 = Exceeds standard

Place a check mark in the appropriate column as you rate each item.

	N/A	O	1	2	3
I. INTRODUCTION					
Abstract of the bilingual vocational training project is given.	___	___	___	___	___
BVT purpose and philosophy statement is included.	___	___	___	___	___
Description of training site is given.	___	___	___	___	___
Project goals are clearly stated and are consistent with the principles of BVT.	___	___	___	___	___
Language group(s) to be served are identified by ESL proficiency level as per assessment tool.	___	___	___	___	___
List of recruitment strategies is given.	___	___	___	___	___
Description of screening procedures is given.	___	___	___	___	___
Support and ancillary services are described.	___	___	___	___	___
Evidence of placement and followup is provided.	___	___	___	___	___

	N/A	0	1	2	3
Staffing patterns are described.	____	____	____	____	____
Staff competencies needed in order to use the curriculum are described.	____	____	____	____	____
Equipment requirements are described.	____	____	____	____	____

II. CURRICULUM DEVELOPMENT PROCESS

Evidence that specific project objectives correspond with specific employment needs of the community is given.	____	____	____	____	____
Evidence of current business and industry input to develop and verify competencies is provided.	____	____	____	____	____
Methods of curriculum evaluation and revision are described.	____	____	____	____	____
Staff participation in curriculum development is described.	____	____	____	____	____

III. COURSE DESCRIPTION

Prerequisite skills are described.	____	____	____	____	____
Vocational topics are identified.	____	____	____	____	____
General workplace communication to PICS are identified.	____	____	____	____	____
Job-specific English topics are identified.	____	____	____	____	____
Employability topics are identified.	____	____	____	____	____
Cultural information and adaptation topics are provided.	____	____	____	____	____
Correlation of all instructional components is evident.	____	____	____	____	____

	N/A	0	1	2	3
IV. CONTENT					
Vocational competencies are stated in measurable behavorial terms.	____	____	____	____	____
Language competencies are stated in measurable behavorial terms.	____	____	____	____	____
Employability competencies are stated in measurable behavorial terms.	____	____	____	____	____
Competencies for state certification are included.	____	____	____	____	____
Safety competencies are included.	____	____	____	____	____
Competencies reflect actual job and training requirements.	____	____	____	____	____
Sample lesson plans are included.	____	____	____	____	____
V. INSTRUCTIONAL METHODS AND TECHNIQUES					
General description of methods and techniques is provided.	____	____	____	____	____
Rationale for selection of methods and techniques is provided based on student population characteristics.	____	____	____	____	____
Methods and techniques take into account specific task requirements.	____	____	____	____	____
Program addresses cultural needs of students.	____	____	____	____	____
Methods require trainees to perform competencies using job-related English when appropriate.	____	____	____	____	____
Development of lesson plans reflects staff coordination.	____	____	____	____	____
A variety of instructional strategies is provided.	____	____	____	____	____
Methods allow for different learning styles.	____	____	____	____	____

	N/A	0	1	2	3
Methods allow for individual learning abilities.	___	___	___	___	___
Decription of the use of both languages and a rationale are provided.	___	___	___	___	___

VI. EVALUATION

Evaluation is based on performance objectives stated in measurable behavioral terms.	___	___	___	___	___
Content provides for ongoing performance assessment	___	___	___	___	___
Pretests are used.	___	___	___	___	___
Posttests are used.	___	___	___	___	___
Methods of documenting competencies achieved are described.	___	___	___	___	___

VII. REFERENCES AND RESOURCES

Current and appropriate references/ resources are utilized.	___	___	___	___	___
Bibliographic format is complete and annotated as to use.	___	___	___	___	___
Available project-generated materials are described.	___	___	___	___	___

VIII. FORMAT

Information is presented in a clear, easy-to-read format.	___	___	___	___	___
Pages are numbered.	___	___	___	___	___
Table of contents or index is provided.	___	___	___	___	___
Material is attractively and durably packaged for the intended user and easily reproducable.	___	___	___	___	___

OVERALL QUALITY

Instructions: Please place an X on the point in the rating scale which best represents your overall judgement of this material. Place the X on the specific point.

Poor		Adequate		Outstanding
1	2	3	4	5

COMMENTS:

Overall strengths:

Overall weaknesses:

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT

Evaluator No. _____:

ATTACHMENT E

BILINGUAL VOCATIONAL TRAINING
DEFINITIONS

ABE	Adult Basic Education
BVT	Bilingual Vocational Training
CBE	Competency Based Education
CBO	Community Based Organizations
ESL	English as a Second Language
GED	General Education Development
IVEP	Individualized Vocational Education Plan
LEP	Limited English Proficiency.
LES	Limited English Speaking
VESL	Vocational English as a Second Language

Advisory Committee	A group of local employers, citizens and/or service providers who meet with program officials on a regular basis to make recommendations to a program.
Basic Educational Skills	Communication, computational, and job department skills. The communication skills include reading, writing, graphic, and electronic communications. The computational skills are arithmetic and logic skills. The sample job skills are punctuality, responsibility, and confidentiality.
Basic Technical Skills	The mechanical, electrical, and manual operation of tools; measurement skills; procedural skills; technical writing; and technical reading.
Bilingual Education	The use of two languages, one of which is English, as a medium of instruction in a classroom or school program.
Bilingual Vocational Training	A program of occupational training or retraining where instruction is provided in two languages, one of which is English. VESL classes, coordinated with the bilingual vocational training, are usually provided.
Community Based Organization	An organization, other than public agencies, operating at the local level to service the needs of particular populations within their communities.

Competency	A demonstrated ability to perform a task successfully. This is a life skills task, which involves language.
Competency Based Education	A performance-based process leading to demonstrated mastery of the basic and life skills necessary for the individual to function in society. It requires assessment of student need; identification of outcomes which are known and agreed upon; instruction focused upon agreed outcomes (competencies); and evaluation of student achievement of competencies.
Criterion-Referenced Test	An objectives-based test that measures student performance against a defined standard set in advance, rather than norm-referenced which measures one student's performance against the performance of others. In CBE, each test item is keyed to a statement of a competency objective in the curriculum.
Cross Cultural Training	Training which develops skills and knowledge and enables students to function effectively according to the cultural expectations of the U.S. workplace.
Cultural Awareness	The ability to act appropriately in the context of American cultural settings and to communicate effectively across cultures.
Curriculum	A defined outline for an instructional program. Minimally, it prescribes WHAT is to be taught. It can also include suggestions for HOW, WHEN and WITH WHAT MATERIALS.
English As A Second Language	English taught to persons whose primary or first language is other than English.
Function	The purpose of communication in a given situation.
General Purpose/Survival ESL	Teaching the English language needed to function generally in the community. Emphasis is on the sequential development of the English language as well as survivial skills in the community.
Individualized Vocational Education Plan	A process of organizing available information (such as skills, education and interest levels) about an individual in order to make decisions about vocational and educational goals and to develop a plan to achieve successfully the goals that have been set. May also be called **ILP,** Individualized Learning Plan; **IEP,** Individualized Educational Plan; and **EDP,** Employment Development Plan.

Inservice Training	Training which is provided before a person undertakes a task or job.
Language Competency	Demonstrated ability using language to perform a task successfully. In the context of adult refugee language instruction, this task is a life skills task.
Language Skills	L = Listening S = Speaking R = Reading W = Writing
Limited English Proficient	A person who has difficulty understanding, speaking, reading or writing English due to a non-English speaking background.
Limited English Speaking	A person who is limited in speaking English due to a non-English speaking background. It is a term often used interchangeably with LEP.
Mastery	The demonstrated ability to perform a competency in a real life situation or according to conditions/criteria which approximate real-life situations as much as possible.
Performance Objective	The description of how mastery of a competency will be demonstrated. It specifies performance, the specific behavior; condition, the performance situation; and criteria, the standard of acceptable performance.
Placement Test	A measure of student ability for the purpose of placing students into program instructional levels.
Pre-Sevice Training	Training which is provided before a person undertakes a task or job.
Proficiency Test	A measure of student ability used for placement and/or progress purposes.
Program Evaluation	Refers to the collection of information to facilitate planning, to aid in the improvement of programs, and to meet accountability demands.
Student Performance Levels	General descriptions of a student's language ability with respect to listening, oral communication, reading, and writing. A student's perforamnce may be different in each of the skill areas.
Task Analysis	A method for analyzing a particular complex act and breaking it down into smaller units (tasks). Task analysis is used in vocational and language training to identify more precisely what a trainee needs to use.

Vocational English As A Second Language	English language instruction related to entry-level employment or training. **Cluster VESL** -- English language instruction which focuses on meeting the language needs for more than one occupation such as the clerical field. Occupations may be grouped by industry, common communication needs, or technical/basic skill needs. **General VESL** -- English language instruction which focuses on general competencies that apply to several or all occupations. The competencies may include those necessary for completing a vocational training program, getting a job, keeping a job, or advancing on a job. **Occupation-Specific VESL** -- English language instruction which focuses on competencies that apply to a particular occupation such as auto mechanics or electronics technician. The competencies may include those necessary for completing a particular vocational training program, getting a particular job, keeping a particular job or advancing in a particular job. **Prevocational VESL** (sometimes used interchangeably with General VESL) -- English language instruction in preparation for vocational trianing, for immediate employment, or English language instruction about the world of work. Topics may include job applications, interviews, want ads and on-the-job communication. **Preemployment ESL** -- Same as prevocational ESL **Worksite VESL** (onsite, on the job workplace) -- English language instruction provided at the place of work. It may focus on Operation-Specific VESL or on general job language skills needed for retraining or upgrading employment.
Vocational Assessment	An evaluation of a client's occupational experience, interest, skills and aptitudes using vocational assessment instruments, sample work stations, and other assessment procedures.
Work Experience	Job skills gained through practical application in a work setting.